33rd WEDC International Conference, Accra, Ghana, 2008

ACCESS TO SANITATION AND SAFE WATER: GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS AND LOCAL ACTIONS

Monitoring of water and sanitation committees using a performance assessment tool

Ampadu-Boakye Joseph, Dotse Francis Mawuena & Laryea Nii Odai Anidaso, Ghana

The paper presents an overview of the Performance Assessment Tool (PAT) developed and utilised in monitoring the performance of WATSAN Committees in beneficiary communities under the KfW financed Rural Water and Sanitation Programme (RWSP) Phase IV and African Development Bank (AfDB) financed Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Initiative (RWSSI) both being implemented in the Ashanti Region of Ghana. Even though the use of the tool presents challenges with regards to resource required to undertake the exercise, the PAT has enormous potential and could be easily adopted and replicated on other projects and for routine monitoring of WATSAN Committees. It also allows for a comparative assessment of WATSAN Committees and could serve as a catalyst for enhancing their performance.

Introduction

A major challenge towards enhancing community ownership, management and sustainability of water supply and sanitation interventions is sustaining the activities of WATSAN Committees during and after project implementation. Most stakeholders in the water and sanitation sector recognise that considerable attention needs to be paid to monitoring and post construction support for beneficiary communities and these can only practically be anchored in the activities of the District Assemblies (DAs)/District Water and Sanitation Teams (DWSTs), Water and Sanitation Development Board and WATSAN Committee. As part of software interventions being implemented under the KfW funded Rural Water Supply Programme Phase IV in fifteen (15) districts of the Ashanti Region, the software consultant, MAPLE Consult has designed and instituted a performance assessment mechanism to measure the performance of WATSAN Committees known as the WATSAN Performance Assessment Tool (PAT). The tool is therefore intended to serve as a means of measuring the performance of WATSAN Committees and their beneficiary communities during and after project interventions have ended.

The PAT derives its conceptual underpinning from the principles of the Functional and Organisational Assessment Tool (FOAT) developed by the Ministry of Local Government, Rural Development and Environment (MLGRDE) in Ghana which requires exact means of verification and eliminates subjectivity. The tool consists of performance measures, indicators for the performance measures, information sources, basis for assessment and a scoring system for each indicator ranging from zero (0) to two (2). The PAT is presented in Table 1.

The performance measures have been classified under three (3) thematic areas namely;

- Committee Organisation
- Committee Finances
- Hygiene Education and Sanitation

Performance measures	Indicators of performance measures	Information source, assessment basis and scoring	Actual score				
WATSAN Committee Organisation	Gender composition of WATSAN Committee	From the Chairman obtain and review gender composition of the membership of the WATSAN Committee. If WATSAN Committee exists and 50% or more of the membership are females, score 2. If between 30-49% are females, score 1 else score 0					
	Meetings of WATSAN Committee	From the Chairman obtain the minutes of meetings of the WATSAN Committee over the last year (or since its formation). If WATSAN Committee had held monthly meetings since its formation with documented evidence (minutes of meetings) score 2. If it met once in every 3 months score 1 else score 0					
	Meetings of WATSAN Committee with the community	From the Chairman obtain documented evidence (minutes) of the meetings of the WATSAN Commit- tee with the community over the last year (or since its formation). If WATSAN Committee met the com- munity at least quarterly since its formation, score 1 else score 0.					
	Preparation of Facility Management Plan	From the Chairman, obtain information on the preparation of the FMP. If the FMP was completed before the commence- ment of drilling, score 1, else score 0.					
	WATSAN constitution signed	From the Chairman, obtain information on the sign- ing of the WATSAN constitution. If the constitution was completed before the com- mencement of drilling, score 1, else score 0.					
Hygiene Education and Sanitation	Preparation and implementation of HSIP	From the Chairman obtain a copy of the Hygiene and Sanitation Improvement Plan (HSIP) that has been prepared and implemented. If the plan exists and 50% or more of the programmes have been implemented with documented evidence, score 1 else score 0					
	Hygiene education	From the Chairman obtain documented evidence (reports/minutes) of hygiene education sessions held to educate community members. If hygiene education sessions were held at least quarterly over the last year with documented evidence, score 1 else score 0.					
	Promotion of hand washing with soap	From the Chairman obtain documented evidence (reports/minutes) of hygiene education sessions held to educate community members. If hand wash- ing with soap formed part of the hygiene education sessions with documented evidence score 1 else score 0.					
	Progress in household latrine con- struction	From the Chairman obtain information on the number of household latrines constructed in the community since the PO entry in the community. If on average more than 2 household latrines have been completed per month since PO entry, score 2. If between 1 and 2/month score 1, else score 0.					
	Availability of household latrines	From the Chairman obtain information on the number of households currently having household latrines. If 50% or more households have latrines, score 2. If between 30-49% have latrines score 1 else score 0.					
	School/clinic sanitation facility (KVIP, WC e.t.c.)	From the Chairman obtain information on the number of schools/clinics (enrolment/outpatients) and their sanitation facilities (institutional KVIPs, aqua privy, WC) and number of drop holes. If all schools/clinics have sufficient appropriate sanitation facilities (institutional KVIPs, aqua privy, WC) score 1 else score 0.					

Performance	Indicators of performance	Information source, assessment basis	Actual		
measures	measures	and scoring	score		
WATSAN Committee Finances	Opening of bank account	From the Chairman obtain WATSAN Committee passbook or savings book. If WATSAN Committee had opened an account and had a savings book or passbook score 1 else score 0.			
	Contribution to capital cost (CCC) paid	From the Treasurer obtain documented evidence of the contribution to capital cost for boreholes and KVIPs (if applicable) by the community to the DA. If full payment of CCC was made before commence- ment of drilling/KVIP construction, score 2. If 75- 99% payment was made score 1 else score 0.			
	Record of financial transactions	From the Chairman and Treasurer obtain docu- mented evidence of records of financial transac- tions (income and expenditure book). If document- ed evidence on financial transaction exists, score 1 else score 0.			

Table 1. A sample of WATSAN committees performance assessment tool (PAT)

Assessment procedure

Information on the indicators for the monitoring should be received from the WATSAN Committee Chairman. DWSTs will be required to inform the WATSAN Committees at least two weeks prior to the monitoring exercise. The WATSAN Committee would also be notified to make the following documents available for the assessment;

- Minutes of WATSAN Committee meetings and minutes of WATSAN Committee meetings with the community
- Facility Management Plan and Hygiene and Sanitation Improvement Plan
- Minutes of hygiene education sessions held to educate community members.
- Record on the number of household latrines constructed in the community since PO entry in the community and the number of households in the community currently having safe latrines.
- Documented evidence of the contribution to capital cost for boreholes and KVIP (if applicable) by the community to the DA.
- Record on the number of schools/clinics (including enrolment/outpatients) and their sanitation facilities (institutional KVIPs, aqua privy, WC,) and number of drop holes.
- WATSAN Committee bank passbook or savings book and documented evidence of records of financial transactions (income and expenditure book).

To facilitate the smooth implementation of RWSP IV, the beneficiary districts have been classified into three (3) zones. To date, the PAT has been administered in all districts in Zone 2. The districts that constitute Zone 2 are: Adansi South, Obuasi Municipal, Atwima Mponua, Amansie Central and Amansie West districts. The outcome of the assessment in Atwima Mponua and a summary of the performance of communities in all the five districts in Zone 2 are presented in Table 2 and Table 3 respectively.

Score	Performance level	No of C'ties in Adansi South	%	No of C'ties in Obuasi Municipal	%	No of C'ties in Atwima Mponua	%	No of C'ties in Amansie Central	%	No of C'ties in Amansie West	%
≤ 15	Very Good	None	0	None	0	None	0	2	2.7	None	0
12-14	Good	5	9.2	None	0	None	0	4	5.5	1	2.1
10-11	Average	9	16.7	None	0	None	0	11	15	10	21.7
8-9	Poor	9	16.7	None	0	3	12	21	28.7	6	13.0
≥7	Very poor	31	57.4	20	100	22	88	35	48.1	29	63.2
Total 54		54	100	20	100	25	100	73	100	46	100

Performance measures	WATSAN Committee Organisation					Hygiene Education and Sanitation						WATSAN Committee Finances					
	Gender Composition of WATSAN Committee	Meetings of WATSAN Committee	Meetings of WATSAN with the community	Preparation of FMP	WATSAN constitution signed	Preparation and Implementation of HSIP	Hygiene Education	Promotion of hand washing with soap	Progress in household latrine construction	Availability of household latrines	School/clinic sanitation facility	Opening of Bank Account	Contribution to Capital Cost (CCC) paid	Record of Financial Transactions	Register of community members	Total	POSITION
Maximum																	
Score	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	2	1	1	2	1	1	20	
Ahyiresu	2	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	1	0	1	1	9	1
Agyeikrom	2	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	1	0	0	1	8	2
Agogoso	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	0	0	1	8	2
Saakrom	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	1	1	7	4
Anansu	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	1	0	1	1	0	0	7	4
Bentinko	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	1	0	1	0	0	1	7	4
Nkrankrom	1	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1	7	4
Okyerekrom	2	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1	7	4
Nwirem	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	0	1	6	9
Adiembra	2	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	6	9
Anwiafutu	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	1	5	11
Bontomuruso	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	0	1	5	11
Adupri	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	5	11
Nkroma	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	5	11
Apenimadi	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	0	0	5	11
Adumasa	2	2	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	11
Anyinasa	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1	5	11
Bayerebon	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1	5	11
Aboabogya	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	5	11
Akantansu	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	2	0	0	5	11
Anyinamso	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	1	5	11
Pamuruso	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	4	22
Bayerebon	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	4	22
Anyinamso	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	4	22
Otaakrom	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1	0	0	4	22
Kwabenakwa	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	3	26
Domeabra	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	3	26
Wansamire	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	3	26
No of com- munities with max. score by indicator	23	3	3	1	1	0	1	0	3	5	4	10	7	4	18		
No of com- munities with min. score by indicator	5	25	25	27	27	28	27	28	25	23	24	18	21	24	10		

Advantages

The PAT can be easily adopted and used in the monitoring of WATSAN Committees. By its nature, it does not require the design and implementation of an elaborate training programme to equip DWSTs on the use of the PAT in monitoring the performance of WATSAN Committees.

The results of the PAT could also be captured in the form of a score sheet as shown in Table 3. This allows for a comparative assessment of the performance of WATSAN Committees against that of their contempo-

raries. The score sheet clearly shows very good performing and weak performing communities and their respective WATSAN Committees. From Figure 3, Obuasi Municipal and Atwima Mponua could be said to have comparatively poor performing WATSAN Committees whiles Amansie Central had a comparatively good performing WATSAN Committees. The pictorial presentation of the outcome of the performance assessment exercise could encourage poor performing WATSAN Committees and communities to improve their performance on the "league table". This could also generate and sustain the interest of communities and districts in their performance as compared their counterparts in other communities or districts.

The PAT could also be used as a tool for determining capacity building needs of the various WATSAN Committees and beneficiary communities in a district. Under the RWSP IV, the results of the PAT are discussed with Partner Organisation (POs) working in the beneficiary districts during quarterly review meetings. The essence is to validate the results and jointly fashion out strategies to address the current capacity gaps in the beneficiary communities. From Figure 3, the capacity of the WATSAN Committees in the areas of hygiene education and sanitation could be said to be weak.

The scoring system is objective and easily verifiable. In effect, it limits the degree of subjectivity since the performance assessment team is required to give exact scores for each performance indicator. This eliminates personal influences and bias in the performance monitoring process.

The PAT is also dynamic and can easily be adapted to monitor the performance of Water and Sanitation Development Boards (WSDBs), Technical Assistants (TAs)/Partner Organisations (POs) and DWSTs. Under the African Development Bank (AfDB) financed Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Initiative (RWSSI) being implemented in Ashanti Region of Ghana, the PAT is currently being used in monitoring the performance of the TA and WATSAN Committees in selected beneficiary districts. The performance indicators of the PAT can also be modified to reflect the current capacity requirements of WATSAN Committees.

Challenges

Performance monitoring of WATSAN Committees with the PAT, like any other monitoring tool would require adequate provision of resources and logistics to enable the DWSTs visit all communities and WAT-SAN Committees to update the scores over a given period. This poses a great challenge to mainstreaming the PAT into the DA/DWST support activities to WATSAN Committees and communities especially after project implementation.

The PAT also allows for the use of indicators which can be easily verifiable and measurable. Obviously, it would be difficult to use the PAT to monitor the performance of WATSAN Committees with respect to indicators which are not easily quantifiable. These indicators include pump site cleanliness, communities' efforts at improving physical accessibility to pump sites and knowledge levels of WATSAN Committee members about their functions. Under these circumstances, the monitoring team could be made to ask questions relating to these issues but not provide scores.

Conclusions

The introduction of PAT system seems to hold enormous potential based upon the short experiences primarily from the RWSP IV and RWSSI both being implemented in the Ashanti Region of Ghana. The PAT system must, however, be supplemented with the commensurate budgetary support by DAs to DWSTs to enable them undertake routine monitoring of WATSAN Committees in their districts. The use of this PAT should not be seen as an end in itself. It would however be worthwhile to ensure that the outcome and/or results of the monitoring arrangements through the use of the PAT are used to improve performance of local institutions towards sustainability of interventions.

References

MLGRDE (2006) Design of a Functional and Organisational Assessment Tool (FOAT) and Process for Local Government in Ghana. Final Report Prepared by MAPLE Consult and Local Government Denmark.

Keywords

monitoring, performance, indicators

Contact details

Ampadu-Boakye, Joseph P.O.Box CT 3700, Cantonments-Accra Tel: 021-241155/241133 Fax: 021-241498 Email: maplecon@ghana.com

Laryea, Nii Odai P.O.Box CT 3700, Cantonments-Accra Tel: 021-241155/241133 Fax: 021-241498 Email: maplecon@ghana.com Dotse, Francis Mawuena P.O.Box CT 3700, Cantonments-Accra Tel: 021-241155/241133 Fax: 021-241498 Email: maplecon@ghana.com