

Section 3

Analysis

An analysis of the issues

The study confirms that the three main actors in the provision of the transport services are:

- users;
- regulators/administrative agencies; and
- operators/transporters.

The actors have formal and informal relationships or partnerships to deal with each other. The formal relationships revolve around the legal jurisdiction and the roles and responsibilities of different actors. The informal relationships revolve around the mechanisms that benefit both actors mutually. In some cases both types of relationships, formal and informal, can be complementary, while in some they can be mutually exclusive.

An investigation into the issues surrounding the relationships between these three main actors is presented here. These relationships influence the transport services sector at both the secondary and tertiary level, and public transport services affect sustainable livelihoods. First, an overview of some of the trends in Karachi.

Spread across an area of 3500km², the population of Karachi exceeds 10 million and has grown rapidly in the last 30 years. There has been a parallel growth in the number of vehicles, both public and private, an increase that has severely taxed the transport system, which virtually collapses at peak hours. Travelling on the roads has become a nerve-wracking experience for passengers. Congestion, discomfort, and the accompanying chaos make users tired and stressed, their clothes become crumpled and dirty, and their shoes lose their polish. Many travel with an extra shirt and have their shoes polished by shoeshine boys before entering their offices. Some small-scale initiatives that users have taken to try to resolve their problems:

Some relationships to supplement transport service

Many offices arrange for a pick and drop van for their staff. Members of staff either pay the operators directly or pay the office, which then pass on the payments to the operators.

Some neighbourhoods organized on a co-operative basis to hire a contract carrier, which picks them up, drops them at work, and brings them back. Suzuki vans are also arranged by the garment industry to transport their female workers to and from work (Hassan 1999).

The scale of these activities is considerable and they are used by tens of thousands of commuters. These partnerships can act as models and be scaled up to reach more people. Tariff structures and quality services can be modified to help poor users to benefit from such small-scale entrepreneurs.

The detailed interviews and forums from which this information was gained are in Appendix 10.



Policy and operational context as perceived by the actors

Urban public transport issues are intricately linked with the overall social, political, and economic context. To understand the links between the policy and practice and sustainable livelihoods, using the sustainable livelihood approach was found to be very useful. A complex and deep-rooted network of variables influences urban public transport activity. Some key findings are presented here.

Inconsistent policies

There is a *lack of any consistent policy* to address urban public transport issues. The situation has worsened as a result of frequent changes in government which has led to decisions at policy and operational level being taken on an *ad hoc* basis. For example, the promulgation in March 1999 of an ordinance concerning the formal establishment of a Karachi Metropolitan Transport Authority by the then Governor of Sindh lapsed by the following June. By January 2000, the new Governor was reported to have not even mentioned the topic in the Annual Development Plan [ADP] for 2000/2001.¹ The policymaking process is non-participative.

Ineffective regulatory framework

There is a *lack of any effective regulatory framework* to oversee the needs of the poor and other users. The transport sector is effectively run by the unregulated and disorganized private sector. There are no reforms to enable the public sector to regulate better the private sector in the best interest of the public.

Inadequate capacity building

There is *no policy to support and build the capacity of the private sector*. The facilities of formal financial institutions and professional organizations are not meeting the needs of the private sector. For example there is no simple way to get a loan to buy a vehicles, no simple way to get the fleet insured for fire and theft, and no insurance available to passengers in case of death or injury during travel or by the vehicles.

Enabling economic policies

Economic policy does not provide an enabling environment for private investment in the public transport sector.

For example, high import duties on new and spare-parts put the private sector

under a huge financial burden. This burden is ultimately transferred to the users of the public transport, as profits have to be maximized by sacrificing safety and quality considerations. Overloading, speeding, disregard of traffic laws, poor maintenance of vehicles, indirect/unauthorized tactics for extracting additional fares, and disregard for the relatively less 'profit-conducive' commuters – seen as women, children, and people with disabilities – results.²

One of the implications of lack of financing is the tendency to purchase more small vehicles. The proliferation of mini-buses and other small vehicles (Suzuki pick-ups) creates many traffic problems, such as:

- increased congestion;
- reduced efficiency in terms of road occupancy vs passenger capacity ratios;
- increased per capita fuel consumption; and
- increased overhead expenses.³

Fuel prices, already inflated because of heavy taxation, have been increased twice in the current fiscal year, with possibilities of further extra-budgetary increases occurring before the end of the fiscal budget period, which reflects the general state of financial affairs in the country.

Targeting the poor

Many policy actions assume a 'trickle-down effect' without properly targeting the poor. One of the incorrect assumptions behind the introduction of a Karachi Public Transport Society (KPTS), chaired by the Sindh Secretary Transport, is that if the demands of the middle-income segments are catered to, then the issues of the low-income commuters will be resolved automatically. Another example is the introduction of new 22-seater coaches on the lucrative Sharae-Faisal routes, instead of on routes where the poor will benefit directly.⁴

Massive informal sector

There is a lack of policy actions to benefit from the massive scale of informal transactions. One example is the financial transaction between users and the conductors during travel. The absence of a formal fare-collection system is encouraging tax evasion as tickets are not issued. This is also the cause of most disputes between operators and the public, including frequent arguments between users and the conductors about the non-return of change due. The conductor operates on the basis of his memory. The result is that there is no evidence whether one has purchased the ticket or not. Accusations about repeated fare collection or non-payments are common. These informal sys-

tems of ticket collection necessitate the employment of two conductors or assistants on each vehicle; one for collecting the money, and another for keeping track of passengers boarding during the collection-round and for calling-out the route at stops.

Integrated city planning

Ineffective city-level master-planning is one of the major sources of direct and indirect adverse effects on transport activity. These effects include:

- traffic congestion and mismanagement;
- infrastructure problems such as broken roads and non-standardized and/or unauthorized speed-breakers;
- the absence of proper bus stops and terminals, including the non-existence of rickshaw stands;
- the inadequate network of routes causing overlapping and gaps and resulting in long travelling –times;
- the absence of any set planning or decision-making standards, therefore a lack of accountability and no proper basis for lodging complaints about irregularities or disputes such as the non-abidance of routes and fares; and
- the lack of co-ordination between utilities carried out -works on the roads.

Policy dialogue among the key actors.

There is a *lack of any positive dialogue –mechanism*, resulting in adversarial relationships among the key actors: users, operators, and regulators. Mistrust is caused by the lack of understanding of each other's roles, responsibilities, and. The impatience and unwillingness to listen of different actors has compounded the level of distrust in the public transport sector. The ultimate sufferers are the users. On many occasions decisions are made on the basis of who can exert pressure on the government. In many instances, this translates into strikes and political rallies.

Freight Traffic is an issue on its own, and is considered separately in the Appendix.

Ineffective governance

Transport infrastructure is not properly managed or maintained. One case in point is the Karachi Circular Railway. Another is the failure to enforce planning regulations; encroachments which were removed from the Saddar area in October 1999 were reported to have returned within three months, in January 2000.⁵

Laws and other regulations are not enforced either. An out-dated approach is one among a host of other factors, but it appears to be the main cause for the overall ineffectiveness of the law enforcement agencies. The result is the blatant existence of numerous irregularities caused by systemic corruption. There is anecdotal evidence that the *bhatta* system is the main reason for the massive scale of road-side encroachers, who are one of the major sources of traffic congestion. Other irregularities are:

- lack of control over fuel adulteration businesses;
- lack of effective punishment after accidents – even where they involve injuries and death – results in the widespread occurrence of accidents;
- frequent traffic and parking violations; and
- frequent interruptions of traffic by policemen conducting mock ‘document checking’ operations (to obtain bribes).⁶

A general lack of concern about accountability manifests itself in the widespread trend of lawlessness and corruption based on personal influence, political relationships, and monetary links with regulatory bodies. This in turn becomes the cause for the violation and bypassing of any ‘inconvenient’ rules and regulations. Thousands of buses operate illegally without route –permits (see the Present set-up and Historical review sections).⁷

An inefficient organizational set-up in the transport sector with unclear roles and responsibilities and many duplications has further destroyed the transport situation. For example, an urgent bill concerning the establishment of KMTA which was put before the Sindh Assembly in May 1999, was subsequently referred by the speaker to the Local Government department on the basis of ‘financial implications’. They in turn referred it to the Transport Department, who sent it to the Mass Transit Cell for ‘expert comments’. All this after a months-long exercise to finalize the draft of the same bill in which all of the concerned departments, and the the departments dealing in Finance and Law, had already minutely examined all aspects of the bill. In this way many plans just remain on the shelves. Delays in roadworks projects cause months of traffic jams and accidents (as was the case in a number of the recent bridges and flyover projects, as well as the already heavily invested Karachi Mass Transit Project) in turn escalating the final completion costs and lack of services to the poor.⁸

There is also the problem that planning and policymaking is detached from both the implementation mechanisms and the public, as the administrative and

regulatory bodies themselves realised in the forum organized by the team during this study to discuss the issues.⁹

Social/Cultural influences

Gender issues in transport activity are rooted to a large extent in the same socio-cultural values. People behave and show their feelings differently in public and private. Some men believe that women travelling without their accompanying male relatives are of inferior character and hence deserve to be treated accordingly. Children and people with disabilities do not get any special treatment. A low literacy rate, particularly among the operators and the users from low-income backgrounds, who form the majority of commuters travelling in large buses and mini-buses/coaches, is the main reason that route numbers and stops are not displayed on the busses. Display was originally required by law and implemented, but then it transformed into the default system where the conductors call out the routes.

Politics directly impacts public transport. Informal partnerships exist between politicians, executives, and the operators. These partnerships are reported to involve political favours, ‘gifts’, and cash payments which directly or indirectly influence the decision-makers. As a part of such partnerships, operators support the politicians during rallies and demonstrations, and free transport is provided to political workers. The users suffer the most as vehicles are diverted to political activities, increasing the already very long waiting times even further.

Civil society and professional networks

As a response to the lack of governance and inappropriate policymaking process, many civic societies and professional institutes are trying to fill the gap by articulating the problems and lobbying effectively against projects which do not appear likely to have positive impacts on the transport situation. Examples include the rebuttal from the organized civil and professional institutions against the proposal for the Karachi Mass Transit Project and Lyari Expressway project. It is not only the content of the arguments against the donor-backed top-down approach that is illuminating, but also the process. (Details can be obtained from the first author.) Some observations are as follows:

- Civil societies are active and organized
- Links and alliances between civil societies and professional institutions are being made.

URBAN PUBLIC TRANSPORT

- Information is hard to hide from the civil societies regarding development projects.
- Development has its political dimension, which is hard to ignore.
- People see transport as an issue with a direct bearing on their livelihoods.
- ‘Lip- service’ consultation will be hard to sell in Karachi.
- Donors and their consultants will have to internalize the concept of partnerships and participation. People are not naïve enough to accept attendance at a meeting as an indication of true partnerships.
- Decision-making processes will have to be transparent.
- Accountability throughout the process, not just at the end, is crucial.



Emerging directions for action from the three actors

This section presents the perspectives of key actors, as identified during the interviews and forums.

The users' perspective

A brief listing of the main concerns and problems faced by the users has already been presented in the preceding section; the focus here is on extracting emerging actions based on the perceptions of the key actors.

What others to do

- Fares should be affordable, and fare increases should be properly designed and planned.
- The public transport sector should offer conditions that will attract a larger and more professional private sector. Economic and development policies should create an enabling environment.
- On the routes where it is not feasible to make a profit, the public sector should directly or indirectly provide public transport services.
- Public transport should be available for longer hours, including after 9pm.
- An affordable service should be available for use during emergencies. At present the most frequently used modes in an emergency are taxis and rickshaws, which are also the most expensive. Better ambulance services should also be introduced. For other activities and travelling, the modes include bicycle, motorcycle, walking, and tanga (horse cart).
- Bus routes should cover the hospital and the service on such routes should be more frequent.
- Space should be provided for luggage such as school bags and shopping bags.
- Corruption should be brought down to a level where it does not allow such massive violations of law and regulations.
- Vehicles should be tested properly for fitness. Corruptly issuing a certificate without a proper examination can endanger lives, and should not be allowed to happen.

- Traffic police should really control traffic and curb violations, not make the routine check-ups simply a source of bribes. A respondent reported that, ‘Even if the drivers have not violated any traffic laws, the police still stop them on the excuse of checking papers, and then they extort bribes of between Rs20 and Rs50’. Drivers should not speed, owners should not create conditions that force the drivers and conductors to speed.
- There should be a minimum qualification for drivers and conductors. They should behave decently and give tickets or receipts for payments.
- The distance between bus stops should be standardized to minimize walking.
- Buses should stop at all bus stops and wait for users to board and alight from safely. Special provisions should be made for women, older people, children and people with disabilities.
- The locations and condition of bus stops should be improved. Basic services, proper ventilation, and shade should be provided.
- Properly designed bus terminals should be provided.
- Bus stops and bus numbers should be properly marked and displayed. Non text-based communication should be explored for providing basic information about travel.
- Travel distance and duration should be minimized by rationalizing the routes.
- An appropriate mix of vehicles should ply the main routes in peak time, in particular more large buses are needed.
- The infrastructure should be maintained better, and the public should be involved in supervision of works to ensure that a high standard of quality is maintained. At present workers are bribed to accept poor quality work.
- Public transport should be made comfortable and a pleasant experience, unlike the current situation, as described in some of the interviews.

Interviews excerpts

From a woman who had to abandon her job because of the poor quality of the transport system: ‘...I used to get delayed in reaching my workplace as well as my home, I was tense all the time, and I felt exhausted; because of these difficulties I stopped going to work.’ D-1.2.

‘The problems of transport have a profound negative impact on our lives; because of the resulting mental tension, we become irritable, and we become victims of high blood pressure and other psychological disorders, and we begin to be depressed most of the time.’ NA-1.1

‘The problems of transport have a devastating effect on our lives, so instead of moving forward we are moving backwards...and our performance is affected.’ NA-1.4

Some of the specific comments are highlighted below:

At a bus stop

- There should be proper law enforcement to prevent the harassment of women.
- Bus stops should be properly designed and provided with facilities such as shade, timetables, and lights.

In the vehicles

- Doors should be designed for the safety and convenience of the users. Two inter-connected doors with no permanent barrier between them is preferable. The doors should be wide enough for passengers to board and alight from the vehicles.
- Seats should be properly designed for the convenience of the passengers. The vehicles should be properly maintained and regularly cleaned.
- Seats should be available to users.
- The buses should not be overcrowded.
- Special arrangements should be made for the disabled. One blind person complained that he has extreme difficulty getting in and out of the vehicles.

- The environment inside the vehicle should be improved from the one described by an interviewee who said that ‘due to the rush and smoke inside the vehicles, I have to change the shirt of my uniform every day, the clothes get all wrinkled-up...I reach my college after a journey of about 35 to 40 minutes, at the end of the journey I have a headache, my mind loses its freshness, I feel a strange restlessness during classes, and I keep sensing the smell of oil in my breath.’ A-3.11
- The use of pressure horns should be strictly prohibited on the grounds of noise pollution.
- Vehicles emitting dark smoke should be removed from the roads. The smoke is injurious to health and spoils clothes. This has financial implication in terms of both health and cleaning.
- The music in the buses should be played at a low volume and it should not be vulgar.

Accidents and their effects

There is an urgent need to improve road safety. Accidents hurt the poor the most. If a poor breadwinner dies or is seriously injured, the household loses the income and has to bear the additional cost. There is no insurance system to cover such situations nor is there any effective social security. Few poor people are covered by any social security, so the only safety net available is taking loans from relatives.

Following are some of the excerpts from the interviews:

Interview excerpts

‘While I was travelling in a W-21 van another bus hit my bus. My leg was badly injured. I could not work for three weeks. My husband and children faced difficulties in maintaining the household jobs. My leg still hurts, I can’t walk long distances now.’

‘A U-9 van crashed with another vehicle, and four men died on the spot. My daughter and sister-in-law were injured in the accident, receiving stitches in the head and legs.’

... continued

I was travelling on the roof of a Zafran Coach, when I fell down and broke my leg. I was admitted to a clinic for two months, incurring expenses of around Rs80,000. I still have to use crutches to move.'

'Our settlement (Awami Colony) is near the National Highway. It is routine here to have 30 to 40 accidents every year, but no action has been taken to improve road safety.'

'On Korangi No.2 1/2 crashed with a mini-bus. My leg was fractured. I was admitted to hospital for two months. I paid thousands of rupees.'

Speed breakers

Properly designed traffic-calming schemes should be introduced. The existing speed-breakers are not effective. The breakers should be marked properly so that the driver does not have to suddenly apply the brakes, which can be dangerous to the passengers or the vehicles behind.

Modes and options

Buses, complemented by rickshaws, taxis, and Suzuki pick-ups should be available in the low-income settlements.

The Circular Railway should be extended and made more effective and efficient.

Travelling by bicycle over small and medium distances is possible but very unsafe at the moment. Action is required to make this mode of transport safer. Alternative modes like rickshaws and taxis are not affordable. The drivers do not use meters and demand very high fares, and where meters do exist they have often been tampered with.

Public transport should be made safe and comfortable for families to use. Consideration should be given to reducing the segregation between men and women. Others feel that the space allocated for women in the buses should be increased.

Contractor carriers

The increased use of contract carriers on certain routes should be explored for low-income settlements. Considering the inferior quality of the general public transport, many users prefer a contract carrier. In some cases the users pay as they use the service, but more often employers hire the contract carrier and deduct the costs from the employees' wages. Contract bus fare range from Rs250 to Rs600 per month, depending on distance. The quality of such services was reported to be superior. Some users use such services only one way to save money, for example they prefer to get to work on time and clean but take their chances on the way home.

What users can do

- Communities should organize themselves to contribute to solving the transport-related problems in the community.
- People should bring change to pay their fares, as the conductor cannot deal with large denomination notes.
- Users should not urge the driver to speed.
- Users should be civil while travelling. Smoking, spitting, and indecent behaviour towards women are unacceptable. Users should also be considerate of fellow passengers.

From the users' point of view, the main problem is the lack of access and poor quality of urban transport. Travel is uncomfortable, extremely so during peak hours. It is also unsafe, and users pay unaffordable prices for such an appalling service. Poor users have no effective platform to raise such issues. There is a huge gap between policy and practice, and one user said that 'there is no procedure or place to even express complaints, let alone make an input during policymaking exercises (URC Forum).'

The transporter/operator's perspective

The diagnosis of the key problems by both users and the operators converge around certain key areas, but the proposed solutions to these problems differ. The views also differ on organizational issues.

The views of the operators have been extracted by interviewing the key informants and conducting forums. A brief listing of the key personnel and organizations that represent operators' views is given in section 2. Some of the key points are as follows:

What others can do

Key general actions

- There is an urgent need to fill the policy vacuum which has existed in this area since the birth of this country. There is a need for a properly thought-out transport policy/plan for Karachi that is based on reality. Operators are willing to contribute to such policy formulations.
- The co-ordination among public agencies should be improved, and any move towards a one-stop service would be highly appreciated.
- The decision-making process should be improved and should invite full and meaningful contribution from operators. *Ad hoc* decisions should be reduced to a minimum. In some key decisions, such as the fixing of fare, the participation of the operators is crucial.
- Capable organizations — not individuals — should be the preferred operators. Currently companies have only 5 per cent of the market.
- Measures should be taken to organize the small entrepreneurs and build their capacity to improve public transport services.
- After the recent recognition of public transport as an industry, benefits such as access to bank loans and insurance services should be made available to the operators at affordable price.
- Simple and transparent procedures should be developed for procuring facilities such as land for bus terminals. Operators are ready to rent, lease, hire, or buy unused government land. In the absence of such positive measure the operators are forced to park and carry out maintenance on the roadsides.
- Road conditions should be improved. Operators are incurring huge maintenance costs because of the poor quality roads, which have deteriorated because of the absence of proper drainage, the overflowing sewers, and the poor of the original construction. In addition the roads are frequently dug up by different utilities and then not properly restored.
- Traffic calming measures should be improved. Traffic-calming humps are badly designed and badly located, causing additional maintenance costs and traffic hazards.

- Better enforcement of the law is needed to eliminate the availability of adulterated oil and fuel. Operators complain that the oil supplied is impure, which not only affects vehicle performance, but is also one reason for the excessive pollution in the city. Unless better quality oil and petrol are provided, the pollution problem will persist. Adulterating oil is a major business in Karachi. Informal factories produce it and then package and market it in brand-name containers.

The operators have some particular problems which need specific attention.

Assimilating informal money lending

Partnerships between the informal and formal financial organizations should be explored to serve the sector better and improve the access and quality of public transport.

In the absence of any formal provision of financial services, operators have no choice but to use the readily available informal financial services. Informal money lending is operated on the basis of no financial collateral, high interest rates, and a strict repayment schedule enforced not through the courts but by ‘muscle’ and other social or rather ‘non-social’ means such as threats and the use of physical force. The operators, in spite of this very harsh financial package, usually take loans from moneylenders at rates as high as 100 to 200 per cent. These high rates have implications for the travelling public, as it means operators must maximize profit at any cost, leading to the stressed behaviour of drivers and conductors. If financial services were accessible, effective, and efficient, it is argued, then access to and quality of public transport would be significantly improved. The nature and dominance of the informal financial services sector has in fact enabled the operators to run the transport business.

The high level of usage of such services also demonstrates the demand and/or lack of formal financial services. Formal financial institutions can learn from the existing situation, and if they are willing to modify their procedures will have an opportunity to exploit such a huge market. It is the formal sector that needs mobilization and not the informal sector.

Compensation for loss during law and order situations

Operators should be compensated when the loss due to of law and order in the city prevents them from working. They should also have access to insurance cover for accidents, deaths, and material loss, and possibly for users and third party claims. The government used to compensate the owner at the market

price if a vehicle was burnt out or damaged during violence in the city. Such practices have now been abandoned despite the loss of between eleven and twelve thousand vehicles in the last two years. This has effectively transferred a significant proportion of risk from the government to the operators.

To combat such situations, entrepreneurs have taken the initiative and set up a self-help compensation and insurance process, described below.

Self-help compensation scheme

The Karachi Bus Owners Association (KBOA) has initiated a Self-Compensation Scheme. Under this scheme each member bus submits Rs15 per day to the KBOA. In the event of violence-related damage, an assessment team ascertains the cost of damage and the KBOA pays up to Rs250,000 within a week to the owner of the damaged bus. This scheme began with a daily fee of Rs2, and the amount was gradually increased.

The formal compensation process that used to be available occasionally was a very lengthy and complex process. Many times only a strike threat produced results, and sometimes the government paid only 25-50 per cent of the total damage.

The self-help compensation scheme was started in 1986 and so far up to Rs20 million has been distributed to members. During this period more than 300 large buses were set on fire. The government has now started to take an interest in the scheme.

A formal approaches could be developed, based on this scheme which the informal sector not only developed but enforced without any recourse to law-enforcing agencies.

Better tax assessment and collection procedures

Operators are willing to pay the tax they owe if the procedure is simple and transparent and the benefits of paying the tax are visible. An arrangement between the Central Board of Revenue and the bus-owners used to exist by which the owners paid income tax according to a mutually agreed formula. But income tax officials constantly harass bus-owners, asking them for far more money than what was agreed. This lack of trust and clarity leads, in many cases, to settlements which benefit the operators and the government officials with a loss to public revenue.

Improved traffic regulations

Appropriate and fair traffic regulations should be developed and enforced, as the existing traffic regulations are out-dated. There must be some effective deterrent to prevent reckless driving, but the existing regulations penalize the owners and not the drivers.

Harassment by police

The level of corruption should be reduced to at least a level where businesses remain feasible and the access to and quality of transport is not significantly affected. The cost of corruption is ultimately borne by the users. Just as the income tax officials harass bus-owners, the police are a permanent bane in the life of bus drivers, implicating them in numerous offences in order to collect excessive bribes. Magistrates are also allegedly involved in this extortion and collect large amounts of money from bus drivers.

Many operators who reportedly pay monthly *bhatta* to the police, and it is alleged that all mini-buses pay a regular amount of up to Rs3000 a month to the traffic police. It was also reported that at least ‘15 per cent of the mini-buses are owned by policemen’.

Corrupt practices

‘... operators pay monthly *bhatta* to police.’

‘... mini-buses pay a regular amount of up to Rs3000 a month to traffic police.’

‘... at least “15 per cent of the mini-buses are owned by policemen”’.

‘The traffic police, instead of controlling traffic, stand in corners and catch drivers and negotiate with them for their own pocket money. Even in traffic *chowkis* the officers take Rs300 to 500 on each *challan* but they submit only Rs25 to 30 to the government treasury.’

‘In the courts (sorry to say) the *peshkars* do the same thing. Now we must think whether we want to change the system or continue as it is.’

... continued

‘Presently there is only a nominal fine of between Rs20 and Rs30 for traffic violations, but the traffic police usually charge around Rs200 to Rs500 on normal violations. All this extra money goes in the pockets of police officials.’

‘The concept of fines was to generate revenue for the government but nothing goes into the government accounts. The traffic police encourage the drivers to violate regulations. When police officials catch a driver, they begin bargaining on the amount of the fine. When both parties settle on the amount, the driver pays but does not get a receipt. This situation has encouraged drivers to think that violating traffic rules is just a matter of paying the police.’

Inconsistencies in bus fares

Karachi’s bus fares are reportedly 70 per cent of those in the Punjab (another province), even though the cost of parts, oil, and petrol are the same all across the country. Thus there is a need to rationalize fare structures across the country. This will lead to improvements in access to and quality of public transport.

Specific actions

The following are some of the specific actions proposed by the transport associations:

- A central bus terminal should be built and maintained.
- Routes should be rationalized and the procedures for approving new routes should be simplified.
- At least three terminals need to be built on the outskirts of the city. The proposed locations are Quaidabad for buses, coaches, and mini-buses coming from the National Highway, Sohrab Goth for passenger vehicles coming from the Super Highway, and Mauripur Road or Sher Shah for vehicles coming from Balochistan.
- Terminals should be developed at the end of each bus and mini-bus route in the city, and parking bays should be built so that buses and mini-buses can pick up passengers at specific approved places.

URBAN PUBLIC TRANSPORT

- Stops should be built for taxis, rickshaws, buses, and mini-buses in all the districts of the city to give passengers easier access to the city and so that operators pick up passengers only at approved places.
- Substantial improvement are needed in traffic management throughout the city to improve vehicular flow.
- To improve co-ordination among the various existing civic organizations, a Karachi Metropolitan Transport Authority (KMTA) is needed to both co-ordinate traffic in the city and provide a platform for improved dialogue among the different actors in the transport sector.
- Banks and other formal institutions should loan money to operators on appropriate conditions to purchase and refurbish buses and other public forms of transport.
- Bus owners should be given financial incentives, such as an exemption from the numerous taxes imposed on the purchase of new vehicles.
- The operators recommended the development of simple, swift, and transparent procedures for imposing penalties for traffic offences.
- The private sector should be allowed to run more large buses.
- Action should be taken to support operator's associations attempts to educate their members in areas such as financial management, dealing with taxes, dealing with legal matters, marketing, bookkeeping and accounts, and collective bargaining.

What operators can do

- Pressure horns should not be used on buses.
- Drivers should not play loud and vulgar music.
- All vehicles should use silencers to reduce noise.
- Owners associations, with help from others, should educate their members to improve access to and quality of transport services. The initiative should come from the government.

The regulatory and administrative agencies' perspective

A forum and workshop was conducted by the URC with the help of Mr Tasneem Siddiqui, Director of the Sindh Katchi Abaadis' Authority (SKAA) at the SKAA offices, in which a number of key issues emerged (detailed documentation can be obtained from the first author of this report). A brief summary of the point of view of the regulating agencies is presented below.

General issues

- There is a need to develop capacity to make realistic projections for short, medium, and long-term travel demands, on the main corridors at least. These projections should take into account the changing physical and socio-economic situations.
- A rationale for selecting public transport options should be developed. The rationale should include consideration for institutional capacity and cultural preferences

These are some of the different options:

- | | |
|----------------|--|
| 1. Bus systems | Mini-bus/conventional/high-capacity Mixed traffic/bus lanes/bus ways diesel/electric |
| 2. Rail system | on-street (tram) Mixed on-street/reservation (LRT) Reserved rail right-of-way (rail rapid transit) shared use of railway (suburban railway) |

In view of the likely constraints in the investment budget, it was felt that least one high-capacity bus system should be tested.

3. Other mass transit systems (e.g. monorails)

- The burden on motorized modes can be relieved by the better use of non-motorized vehicles such as bicycles etc.
- Any improvements such Light Rail Transport and rail mass transit technologies, if undertaken, should be demonstrably cost effective. The considerations should also include life-cycle cost. Current institutional capacity and coverage of low-income settlements should be considered.

- The existing urban railway services should be expanded to cover low-income settlements. The service should be effective and efficient.
- To relieve the pressure on roads, urban railways could be used for freight transport.
- Linkages among different mode of transport should be explored to improve the access to and quality of public transport.
- Infrastructure improvements like grade-separated intersections could reduce congestion. Proper maintenance of the existing infrastructure is urgently required.
- Passenger carrying capacity needs to be improved.
- The importance of affordability is particularly relevant for the provision of services to the poor. Affordability and the role of the private sector are closely linked. If a scheme can be developed which can be funded largely or entirely by private sector interests and can achieve full cost-recovery with affordable fares to the users then the burden on government can be minimized. This would also free up government resources and enable spending in other important areas. The role of public and private partnerships is vital in providing access to quality public transport services. Recent Karachi Transport Corporation experience has shown clearly some of the difficulties of running a state-owned enterprise. On the other hand, there are problems associated with the private sector too, particularly with regard to some irresponsible behaviour. It is clear that the choice is not either/or but to develop a relationship which enables both sectors to deliver quality services to the users. Some functions such as regulation must always remain with the public sector; others, such as those which require entrepreneurial flair may be better handled by the private sector. Particular opportunities for the private sector should be identified, such as financing, construction, local manufacture, operation, etc. Different contractual arrangements such as concessions, leasing, or franchising should be explored for the role of the private sector in the local context.

The following is an example of an initiative where a partnership between the public and private (non-commercial) sector improved transport.

Citizen's initiatives in managing traffic in Karachi

In early 1997 a group of senior government functionaries and professionals from the private sector collectively mobilized the government machinery to establish its role in the management of traffic in the city. With the blessings of the Home Secretary and the Commissioner, a Traffic Management Project (TMP) was established through a standing order issued by the Inspector General of Police. The first step was taken at Karachi Airport by co-ordinating the functions of the Civil Aviation Authority (CAA), the Airport Security Force (ASF), Pakistan International Airlines, the district police, and the traffic police. The ASF reopened the arrival lane (adjacent to the concourse) which had been closed because of security problems and congestion caused by drivers parking in non-parking areas, traffic signs were put up and bays were opened in the parking area, three forklifts were provided by the CAA to remove vehicles parked in no parking areas, while the Deputy Inspector General (DIG) Traffic provided a well-trained police force to make sure the traffic rules were implemented. Many of these changes have been sustained ever since.

Building on the initial success at the airport, in October 1998 the Chief Secretary (Sindh) directed a Steering Committee to expand the TMP to other areas of Karachi. This Committee consists of the Chief Secretary as the Chairman, the Home Secretary, the Inspector General (IG) Police, the Commissioner, the DIG Traffic and four professionals.

On 3 March 1999 the TMP was extended to the 14km-long Shara-e-Faisal, the road from the airport to the Hotel Metropole. Before launching the Shara-e-Faisal project, the TMP discussed and sought the support of the senior members of the government of Sindh, the police officials and their personnel who were going to be deployed to manage the project, senior army officials, and representatives of public transporters. The Commissioner Karachi, the Deputy Commissioners (DCs), the SSPs (Police), and the Senior Traffic Magistrates of District Malir, South and East provided support by way of organizing the whole exercise and lending administrative capacity. Away from the congested City Courts in the old part of town, a makeshift traffic court was established at a convenient place, on the junction of Shara-e-Faisal and Shahrah-e-Quaideen.

The initial results of this intervention have been most encouraging. Prior to this intervention, the number of *challans* (tickets) issued for traffic violation averaged 25 per day. The income to the provincial exchequer for the entire year of 1998 was Rs260,000. After the intervention they have increased to an average of 850 per day, bringing into the provincial exchequer a sum of Rs 55,000 per day, or a projected sum of little over Rs20 million per year (in contrast to the Rs260,000 for an earlier year) from Shara-e-Faisal alone.

The significance of this intervention is that:

- it is not a donor-driven NGO project pretending to succeed where the government has failed; and
- the government has been made to initiate a comprehensive and long-term intervention by relying entirely on its own administrative infrastructure, and without incurring any additional expenses, either through local resources or through borrowed money.

This exercise, once again, reiterates the obvious: that the missing links are the collapse of the government, its lack of political will, and the absence of modern structures of administration. If the programme can be expanded and sustained, then it will demonstrate that with a system of accountability and public pressure, the existing administrative machinery could go a long way towards establishing norms of good governance.

Specific suggestions

1. Relocate encroachers like vendors cart pullers away from existing bus stops by allocating marked space for them at the new bus terminals.
2. Traffic control, signalling, and management systems should be improved. Errant drivers should be penalised not only with fines but also with imprisonment.
3. Bus designs should be changed to accommodate the increasing number of women commuters who need more space.
4. Through a planned exercise the number of big buses should be systematically increased.
5. Buses and mini-buses should not be allowed to wait for more than three minutes at intermediary stops.
6. Bus terminals, depots, and workshops should be provided to serve public transport vehicles and operators from using the roads. This would reduce the chronic congestion on the roads as well as facilitating faster and less polluted traffic.
7. The area within 250m of all major road junctions must be cleared of all encroachments, car parking, and other related facilities. These junctions are the worst bottlenecks and snags in the flow of traffic.

ANALYSIS

8. Segregated bus lanes should be created on all major arteries, with the traffic police responsible for the proper movement of traffic. Not only would this reduce average travelling time, but would also increase the efficiency of the whole system. This has been done successfully with remarkable results in many other countries.
9. Bus routes should be rationalized, as they have not been reformulated in Karachi since 1972. This will reduce distances and cut down travelling time.
10. The relocation of truck stands, warehouses, and oil terminals out of the city to Sohrab Goth and Port Qasim is essential to ease the congestion caused by the movement of heavy vehicles on inner-city roads. For access to Karachi Port, priority must first be given to the development of the Northern Bypass rather than to any other costlier options.
11. The introduction of a proper transport system for schoolchildren to replace individual pick-and-drop system would also help to decrease traffic congestion in the city considerably.

