

Appendix 1

Considerations in developing checklists

Users from selected settlements

a. Personal data

Name
Age
Sex
Address/contact

b. Educational background

c. Nature of work

Place of work
Family size
Number of family members who use transport daily

d. Travelling time

Time and distance from home to bus stop
Waiting time at bus stop
Interchange; is more than one mode needed?
Time needed to complete interchanges

e. Environment

Waiting environment/ placement of bus stops present/desired
Environment inside bus or mini-bus
Hygienic conditions during travel
Seating and standing conditions
Women's/children's perspectives
Dealing with conductors and drivers
Music/horn/noise/smoke
Horns and cassette records

f. Health and safety

Getting in or out safely
Speed of vehicles
Single or double exit and partition for women
Impact on body or clothes
Experience of road accidents
Speed breakers
Pedestrian aspects

g. Modes and options

Accessibility of transport
Choice of travel and quality
Bus routes
Satisfaction with existing system in terms of quality
Willingness to pay more for better service
What options are available?
Why using present mode or route?
During emergencies, which services are available?
What about school children?
Do you occasionally use rickshaws or taxis?
What about transport for marriages and deaths?
Use cycles?

h. Finances

Daily cost of travelling one way and return
Monthly income
Monthly expenditure of transport or travelling

i. Corruption

j. Suggestions/ideas for improvements

Operators

a. Personal data

Name
Age
Sex
Address/contact
Family background

Educational background
Nature of work
Place of work

b. Finances

Tariff/fares
Capital investments
Running cost
Duty and taxes
Insurance
Purchasing process
Loans from bank or informal sector
Interest on loans

c. Major operational problem/issues

Law and order situation
Traffic rules/ dealing with traffic police
Nature of traffic violations
Role and responsibilities
Selection of drivers and conductors: criteria and working terms and conditions
Licensing producers
Major problems to operate transport
Horns and cassettes
Timekeepers and their systems

d. Operation and maintenance

Oil and petrol quality and spare parts
Road conditions
Fitness test
Operation and maintenance
Chassis/body-making process
Design of the vehicles

e. Corruption

f. Suggestions/ideas

Profiles of the transport workers (drivers and conductors)

- *Personal data*
 - Name
 - Age
 - Sex
 - Address/contact
 - Family background
- *Educational background*
- *Nature of work*
 - Place of work
 - Driving hours
 - Terms and conditions of work
- *Living conditions*
- *Training*
- *Selection criteria*
- *Education level*
- *Working environment*
- *Facilities; somewhere to retire/bath/eat*
- *Salary or wages*
- *Use of drugs*
- *Experienced any accidents/story with impact on his life*
- *Dealing with traffic police*
- *How to improve traffic rules*
- *Nature of traffic violations*
- *Corruption aspects*
- *Suggestion/ideas*

Organizational profiles of transport associations

- *Name of organization*
- *Year established*
- *Registered*
- *Address/contact*
- *Background*
- *Number of members*
- *Procedure for membership*

- *Nature of activities*
- *Name and address of main office bearers*
- *Kept record of activities?*
- *Regular elections?*
- *Last elections were held on?*
- *Prepare reports/newsletters/progress reports*
- *Annual audit*
- *Benefits for members*
- *How helpful for the members*
- *Keep proper record/file of newspaper statements*
- *Need any technical support to improve working*
- *Hold regular meetings of general body*
- *Political affiliations*
- *Finances*

Regulators

- *Nature of the regulatory body*
- *Contact persons*
- *Address/contact numbers*
- *Area of operations/main task or mandate*
- *Dealing with transport operators*
- *Regulatory constraints*
- *Political interference*
- *Administrative interference*
- *Co-ordination problems with other government agencies*
- *Judicial procedures/law*
- *Rush hour options*
- *Monopoly*
- *Scheduling of operation of buses / mini-buses*
- *Time table and rerouting*
- *Rational routing*
- *Policy changes*
- *Financial services for transport operators / loan insurance*
- *Roads: existing roads and development of new network*
- *Problems of encroachments*
- *Development of bus terminals/workshops*
- *Reduce small vehicles and brings large buses*
- *Corruption aspects*

Citizen's initiative

- *Need for citizen's initiative*
- *Management structure or set up*
- *Development phases*
- *Finances*
- *Problem encountered*
- *Car parking project*
- *Nature of violations details with figures*
- *Monitoring system*
- *Results of the project*
- *Replication possibilities in low income areas*
- *Future extensions*

Appendix 2

Urban Resource Centre

FORUM

Urban Resource Centre is an NGO which carries out documentation, research and related activities about the various environmental issues of Karachi.

'FORUMS' are a regular feature among URC's activities, these are discussion gatherings in which various parties involved in any particular issue are invited for having a dialogue and formulating solutions.

Today's gathering is in connection with a research project on 'Transportation' being conducted by URC in collaboration with the Water, Engineering & Development Centre (WEDC, Loughborough Univ., U.K.)



Brief Description of the Research



Investigations about the impacts on low-income communities, due to deficiencies of access and quality in transport activity, are being used to create a motivation for self-improvement among all the actors involved.

Five low-income localities, from four different corners and one from the central part of the city were visited. Over 100 interviews of low-income people – who are the major users of public transport – have been completed, revealing the impacts of transportation problems on their lives, specially in terms of negative repercussions on income-generating opportunities. Supported by field observations, interviews with other stakeholders, and a literature/historical review, these findings are a matter of concern, not just from the angle of the well-being of the low-income people (estimated to be about 50% of the total population of the city), but also because the deprivations of this major segment of the population affect the economy of the whole city, with fall-outs on all the remaining segments of the population as well.

A series of FORUMS and Workshops are now being used for establishing a dialogue among all the parties who together constitute the 'providers' of transport, while a documentation of this whole process is also being carried out as a basis for influencing policy-level actions, and also for possible replication in other cities of the developing world.

Partnerships to improve access and quality of public transport for the urban poor

Major Findings of the Survey

The basic assumption of the research has been confirmed by the research findings, that transport activity has a major contribution on the lives of the low-income segments, it is the means for them to connect with their livelihood sources, as well as other necessities, such as health and education services, markets, and social/recreation activities. The chart given below displays a brief review of the findings:

TRANSPORT ACTIVITY PROBLEMS ARE HAVING A NEGATIVE IMPACT ON THE LOW-INCOME SEGMENT, WITH REPERCUSSIONS ON THE ECONOMICS AND WELL-BEING OF THE WHOLE CITY

THE THREE PERSPECTIVES

USERS	OPERATORS	REGULATORS
Cost	Fares	Lack of Funding
Reliability	Financing	Interference
Safety	Infrastructure	Lawlessness
Environment / Comfort	Inadequate Policies	Etc.
Location	Non-implementation	
Traveling Time	Bhatts/Corruption	
Impacts / Pollution	Licensing	
	Fuel Prices and Quality	

EXPLORATION OF SOLUTIONS THROUGH PARTNERSHIPS



Today's FORUM: 'ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES'

The following three categories of issues are proposed as a basis for opening the discussion:

1. Alienation of Planning /Policy-making activity
2. The Implementation Gap
3. Proposals and Perceptions

The intention of this research project, and the FORUM being conducted at present, is to try to set up a continuing dialogue process between all the parties dealing in 'Transportation', as the first step in working together for solutions.

Further FORUMS and Workshops are expected to create a common communications parameter between all the parties involved in transportation activity.



Appendix 3

Profile of the users

The following is a sample profile of users based on the 108 interviews conducted under this study. The following is from information respondents in selected low-income areas. Approximately 29% of the respondents were female while 71% were male. Special arrangements were made to interview the women.

Age profile of the users interviewed	
Age range	%
Under 18	20
19-25	18
26-35	26
36-45	16
46-55	16
55 plus	4

There is a significant proportion of children travelling by public transport.

Transport users per household	
No. of users per household	%
1	31.91
2	18.64
3	17.02
4	23.40
5	14.89
6	2.13

Most household members use public transport.

Educational profile of the users	
Level	%
Illiterate	18
Primary	11
Up to higher secondary school	52
Graduate	13
Masters	6

Most of the users were involved in travel for study.

Appendix 4

Examples of the activities in research process

1. On 1st November 1999, Dr Sohail and Muhammad Younus discussed the scope and activities of the research programme.
2. On 2nd November 1999, Dr Sohail, Younus and Arif Hasan discussed the methodology and process.
3. On 4th November 1999, the URC Council discussed the proposal with Dr Sohail and endorsed its approval to carry on this research.
3. On 5th November 1999, Dr Sohail and Younus discussed the criteria and issues of the research. The meeting was also attended by Noorjhan and Adnan from URC
4. On 10th November Dr Sohail and Younus discussed the financial details of the research. Later on the draft technical details were also discussed with Arif Hasan.

Appendix 5

Considerations in selection of the settlements

A settlement (originating point)

1. Legal status of the settlement:

Karachi abadi / recently leased / regularized / notified / unauthorized

2. Public transport used by the people
3. A combination of transport used
4. Purpose of the transport

Work / emergency / visits / school

5. Distance from city centre
6. Users in terms of variety of age and gender

List of the potential settlements

A) District West

Gulshan-e-Zia/Bihar/Ghaziabad/
New Mainwali Colony
Ittehad Town
Mahjir Camp
Rashidabad
Lal Bahar
Metrovile
Qabsa Town
Baba Bhit Island
Yousuf Goth Allah Wali

B) District Central

Mosa Colony
Rehmanabad
Phar Ganj
Bara Maidan
Siraj Colony
Azizabad Katchiabadi
Sohrab Goth afghan basti
Haji Mureed Goth

C) South

Nawa Lane
Dhobi Gatt
Muhammadi Colony
Chanser Goth
Manzoor Colony, Kashmir Colony
Punjab Colony
Shah Rasool Colony
Shireen Jinnah Colony
Shah Rasool Colony

D) East

Essa Nagir
PIB Colony Karachi abadis, Nishtar Colony, Liaquat Colony
Shah Faisal Colony
Zia Colony Korangi
Shanti Nagir

E) Malir

Rehri
Ibrahim Hiaheri
Bhitaiabad
Safura Goth
Ayub Goth
Memon Goth

Shortlist of the settlements for final selection

Haji Mureed Goth
Ibrahim Haideri
Phar Ganj
Rehmanabad
Gulshan Bihar
Manzoor Colony
Zia Colony Korangi
Bhitaabad
Nawa Lane/Bhobi Ghatt
Baba Bhit Island
11 Shireen Jinnah Colony
Yousuf Goth Allah Wali North Karachi a
Shah Rasool Colony
Shah Rasool colony

Draft proposed list of the settlements

Zia Colony Korangi
Nawa Lane/Bhobi Ghatt
Shireen Jinnah Colony/ Shah Rasool Colony
Yousuf Goth Allah Wali North Karachi a

Appendix 6

Review of transport modes and infrastructure in Karachi							
Modes		1729 - 47	1947 - 57	1958 - 68	1968 - 78	1978 - 88	1988 - 99
Road Transport							
Passenger	Government	City buses Intercity					
	Private	Buses City Intercity Mini-buses Taxis Rickshaws Cars Motorcycles Bicycles					
Freight	Government	Freight					
	Private	City Intercity Travellers Tankers Bowlers					
Railway							
Passenger	Local intercity						
Freight	Local intercity						

Appendix 7

Monitoring tool 1

KARACHI TRANSPORT STUDY PROGRESS REVIEW

'Partnerships to improve access and quality of public transport for the urban poor' – Case study: Karachi

RESEARCH / ANALYSIS			SYNTHESIS & COMPILATION			PRESENTATION	
Premise	Action	%	History	%	Current Situation	%	Report / Posters / D-H Transparencies
<p>CONCEPT</p> <p>The basic assumption of the research project is that transport services make a significant contribution to the livelihood strategies of the urban poor. The project aims to identify the factors that influence the accessibility and quality of transport services for the urban poor, and to develop strategies to improve them.</p> <p>The project is organized into three main phases: Research / Analysis, Synthesis & Compilation, and Presentation.</p> <p>Research / Analysis involves identifying the key issues and challenges faced by the urban poor in accessing transport services. This includes understanding the current situation, the needs and expectations of the urban poor, and the role of different transport modes and providers.</p> <p>Synthesis & Compilation involves analyzing the data collected during the research phase and identifying key findings and recommendations. This includes synthesizing information from different sources and compiling it into a coherent report.</p> <p>Presentation involves communicating the findings and recommendations to the relevant stakeholders and advocating for policy and program changes to improve transport services for the urban poor.</p>	<p>UNDERSTANDING THE CURRENT SITUATION</p> <p>The first step in the research process is to understand the current situation of transport services in Karachi. This involves conducting a literature review, field research, and interviews with key stakeholders.</p> <p>IDENTIFYING KEY ISSUES AND CHALLENGES</p> <p>Based on the findings of the research phase, the project team has identified several key issues and challenges that affect the accessibility and quality of transport services for the urban poor. These include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of affordable and reliable transport services Overcrowding and poor service quality Limited access to transport services for certain groups of the urban poor Weak regulatory framework and enforcement <p>DEVELOPING STRATEGIES TO IMPROVE SERVICES</p> <p>To address these issues and challenges, the project team has developed several strategies and recommendations. These include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strengthening the regulatory framework and enforcement Improving the quality of service and safety Developing new transport modes and services Enhancing the role of the private sector 	100	<p>INTRODUCTION</p> <p>This is the most significant portion of the report, covering all the key findings and recommendations.</p> <p>1.1 - BACKGROUND</p> <p>This section provides an overview of the transport situation in Karachi, including the current situation, the needs and expectations of the urban poor, and the role of different transport modes and providers.</p> <p>1.2 - CURRENT SITUATION</p> <p>This section provides a detailed analysis of the current situation of transport services in Karachi, including the key issues and challenges identified during the research phase.</p> <p>1.3 - KEY FINDINGS</p> <p>This section presents the key findings of the research phase, including the factors that influence the accessibility and quality of transport services for the urban poor.</p> <p>1.4 - RECOMMENDATIONS</p> <p>This section presents the key recommendations of the research phase, including the strategies and measures to improve transport services for the urban poor.</p>	100	<p>1.1 - INTRODUCTION</p> <p>This section provides an overview of the transport situation in Karachi, including the current situation, the needs and expectations of the urban poor, and the role of different transport modes and providers.</p> <p>1.2 - CURRENT SITUATION</p> <p>This section provides a detailed analysis of the current situation of transport services in Karachi, including the key issues and challenges identified during the research phase.</p> <p>1.3 - KEY FINDINGS</p> <p>This section presents the key findings of the research phase, including the factors that influence the accessibility and quality of transport services for the urban poor.</p> <p>1.4 - RECOMMENDATIONS</p> <p>This section presents the key recommendations of the research phase, including the strategies and measures to improve transport services for the urban poor.</p>	100	<p>1.1 - INTRODUCTION</p> <p>This section provides an overview of the transport situation in Karachi, including the current situation, the needs and expectations of the urban poor, and the role of different transport modes and providers.</p> <p>1.2 - CURRENT SITUATION</p> <p>This section provides a detailed analysis of the current situation of transport services in Karachi, including the key issues and challenges identified during the research phase.</p> <p>1.3 - KEY FINDINGS</p> <p>This section presents the key findings of the research phase, including the factors that influence the accessibility and quality of transport services for the urban poor.</p> <p>1.4 - RECOMMENDATIONS</p> <p>This section presents the key recommendations of the research phase, including the strategies and measures to improve transport services for the urban poor.</p>

Appendix 8

Monitoring tool 2

Activity	Date	Resource people	Remarks
1. Synthesis of available information			
a) Secondary data	10 December	Younus	Also co-ordinate and monitor overall research, fieldwork, review the interviews, co-ordinate with Sohail and develop technical details
b) Historic perspective	15 February	Arif Hasan	Also prepare executive summary, review report and quality control
2. Fieldwork		Zahid Farooq Noor Jhan Adnan Rizwan	
a) Pilot Phase first round of fieldwork	25 November	-Do-	Selection of settlement and testing of the methodology
b) Second round of fieldwork	26 November - 15 January	-Do-	100 interviews in settlement 6 interview with owners 10 interview with regulators
c) Organizational/ individual profiles	19 November - 15 January	-Do-	10 associations 10 transport workers 3 traffic police
3) Report writing and documentation	10 November - 15 January 1st Draft on 30 January	Asia Sadiq	Also document forums, develop route maps and review of secondary information
4) Publication	15 February	Dr Sohail	

Outline: Transportation Study

i. Introduction to the study

1. Background of the study

Relationships and outcome for DFID (Why this study?)
WEDC, URC Purpose: Critical issues and methodology
(what will be?)

2. Research methodology

(Complete documentation of the process)
Criteria for settlements chosen

ii. Historical perspective

Development of the city and its relationship to
transport service
Policy impact/central govt. policies/provincial response
Specific policies adopted in Karachi or policy changes
Major institutional development
Transport/planning link
Modes use routes
Routes developed

iii. Situational analysis

1.0 Issues identified

Accessibility, provision or lack of it quality
Quality of transport
Management
Relationship to city planning
Nature of plans by agencies
Environmental repercussions
Transport groups
Lack of terminus and other physical facilities like bus stops,
footpaths etc.
Cost/prices
Routes: too many/too little information
Bus stops
Type of transport (mini-bus)
Longer plans like Lyari Express Way / Regulation & operate
and maintenance
Institutional problems
Corruption
Police - transporter relationship
Users - transporter relationship
Organization of the transport

2.1 Identification of the various interest groups and users related to the transport sector (Institutional Setup)

Users types,
Transporters / operators
Regulators

2.3.0 Perspective of key actors

2.3.1 User's perspective on;

Travelling time
Physical and environmental quality of the facilities
Health and safety
Modes used
Financial aspect; prices

2.3.2 Operator's perspective on;

Travelling time
Physical and environmental quality of the facilities
Health and safety
Modes used
Financial aspects; prices
Trips/fares
Capital Investment/running costs
Duties and turns
Operate and maintenance issue
Insurance
Purchasing process
Loans / Interest on loans
**Transport workers drivers and conductors
perspective
(existing conditions and causes)**

Transport association's perspective

3.3.0 Regulators perspective on;

Planning aspects
Resultant conditions and is causes / effects
Future trends

3.4.0 Citizens Initiatives/special projects

Planning aspects
Resultant conditions and its causes / effects
Future trends

3.4.0 Citizens Initiatives/special projects

iv. Recommendations

Trends (based on research results)
Policy level recommendations
Long term
Short term

Appendices

Question samples
Profiles of transporters / users / agency officers / citizens
initiatives
Photographs of conditions / Photographs of interviews

Appendix 9

Monitoring tool 3

TRANSPORT FOR THE URBAN POOR IN KARACHI

Final Report

DRAFT OUTLINE AND COMPLETION DATES

SECTION (A) - HISTORY

- Central Govt. Policies
(Implemented or not by Prov. Govt. ?)
- Policy Changes (incl. Reasons)

SECTION (B) - CURRENT SITUATION.

- Modes of Transport.
 - *Numbers.
 - *Organisations -History, Functions, Profiles.
 - *Manner of purchase? Who sells? Who Buys? (Ethnicity)
 - *Mechanism of Profit-making.
 - *Maintenance Issues
- Regulating Authorities.
 - *Types & Functions?
 - *(Structure/Duties Powers?)
 - *Relationship b/w Transporters & Authorities.
 - *Formal.
 - *In Formal.
- Services Sector to Transportation
 - *Spare Parts, Stations (operation system), Conductors, Cafes, etc.
- Special Projects
 - *Sami Mustapha's Proposal.
 - *Metro Bus.
 - *Contracted Buses.
 - *Contract Taxis/Vans.

SECTION (C) - USERS & OPERATOR VIEWS.

- | | |
|--|-----------|
| *Women | *Comfort? |
| *Why contracts? | *Routing? |
| *Improvements? | *Cost? |
| *Resulting Impact on Socio-Economic life & Health. | |
| *Suggestions about Improvements | |

COMPLETION TARGETS		DATES
1.	History' Draft.	Feb.4 Thur.
2.	Current Situation.(Outline at least)	Feb.11
3.	Complete Interviews.	Feb.18
4.	Summary of Analysis of Interviews (Computerised)	Feb.25
5.	Forums-all organizations. ("Do you want any addition?)	Mar.2 nd
6.	Meetings / Officials (-Discuss results of survey).	Mar. 2 nd
7.	Complete Report.	Mar.9 (or 16)

Appendix 10

Urban Resource Centre

3/48 Mualimabad Housing Society Jamal uddin Afghani Road off Khalid bin Walid Road Karachi
74800 Pakistan Tel. & Fax: 92 21 4559275, E-mail, urc@inet.com.pk Web: www.urckarachi.org

URC-FORUM

Partnerships to Improve Access and Quality
of
Public Transport for the Urban Poor

'THE ROLE OF ADMINISTRATIVE AGENCIES'

Invited Participants:

1. Secretary Transport		9. Planning Commission	PC
2. Regional Transport Authority	RTA	10. Karachi Municipal Corp.	KMC
3. Traffic Engineering Buereau, KDA	TEB	11. Cantonement Board	Cant.
4. Traffic Police	DIG	12. Karachi Circular Railway	KCR
5. Master Plan & E.C. Dept., KDA	MP&ECD	13. Excise & Taxation	E&T
6. Public Transport Authority	PTA	14. Communication & Works	C & W
7. Mass Transit Cell KDA	MTC	15. P & D Department	P & D
8. Sind Katchi Abadi Authority	SKAA	16. Transport Department KU	KU

Program:

1. Introduction	10 mins.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Research ObjectivesImportant FindingsFindings related to Administration Agencies
2. Discussion on Issues	60 mins.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Degradation in Quality of Public TransportImprovement of Co-ordination among AgenciesThe Implementation GapNeed for Monitoring / Data CollectionPossible Alternatives & ImprovementsPolicy and Planning Suggestions
3. Conclusion	10 mins.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Comments and Resolutions

Date & Venue:

DATE : MARCH 29, 1999
VENUE : Sindh Katchi Abadi Authority opposite Arts Council. Tel: 9211275
TIME : 2 : 00 P.M.

Appendix 11

Example of questions used in some interviews

TRANSPORT FOR THE URBAN POOR – KARACHI

Policy Decisions – Historical Background and Current Situation **(Interviews)**

- | | | | |
|----|-----------------------|---|---|
| 1. | Choudhry Ismail Sahab | - | Bus Owners Association |
| 2. | Brig. Qasim Sahab | - | Chairman, Chartered Inst. of Transportation |
| 3. | Mr. Yahya Waliullah | - | Sindh Planning and Development Dept. |

Important Queries :

(History)

1. Which of the policies in the past about public transport in Karachi have been successful in your opinion ?
2. Reasons ?
3. Can you please provide us with reference material about these policies ?
4. Which of the policies in the past have been most unsuccessful in your opinion ?
5. Reasons ?
6. Can you please provide us with reference material ?
7. Has there been any continuity in the policies made during various regimes ?
8. When and in what way have the policies been changing in the past ?
9. Has there ever been any professional input in the policy-making process ?
10. Has public opinion ever been explicitly included in the policy-making process ?
11. Can you describe the most vivid examples, in your opinion, of how changes in the public transport situation have had direct impacts on the economic /commercial activity in the city ?
12. During the Ayub era people were encouraged from the private sector to participate in the public transport sector, can you describe the details of the mechanism involved ?
13. Did the declaration of transport as an 'Industry' have any impact on the situation?
14. What are your views about the new metro-bus service ?

(Current Situation)

15. What kind of a policy-making mechanism is best suited for Karachi in your opinion ?
16. Would you like to propose any specific policies or strategies which you think should be considered in any future plans for public transport policies ?
17. What do you think is the most important issue in connection with public transport activity in Karachi, and how could it be addressed at the policy-making level ?

(Implementation)

18. Have there been any examples of relevant policy decisions being taken which were not able to be implemented ?
19. What were the reasons for non-implementation in your opinion ?